Christ and the Undivided Young Adult: Clues from Merton and More

By Padraic O'Hare

Gerard Manley Hopkins writes:

As kingfishers catch fire, dragonflies draw flame; As tumbled over rim in roundy wells Stones ring; like each tucked string tells, each hung bell's Bow swung finds tongue to fling out broad its name; Each mortal thing does one thing and the same: Deals out that being indoors each one dwells; Selves – goes itself; *myself* it speaks and spells, Crying *What I do is me: for that I came*.¹

The monk David Steindl-Rast declares: "Faith in Jesus as the Christ implies we recognize in Jesus our own human-divine self, the self that bears God's image and is alive with God's own breath. This is not belief in something outside ourselves, but existential trust that God's loving presence can be realized in us, and through us, in the world." The monk Thomas Keating adds: "The basic text of Christian practice is 'The Father and I are one.' Christ came to save us from our sins The source of all sin is the sense of the separate self." According to Thomas Merton: "Christ forms Himself by grace and faith in the souls of all who love Him Therefore if you want to have in your heart the affections and dispositions that were those of Christ on earth [e]nter into the darkness of interior renunciation, strip your soul of images and let Christ form Himself in you by His Cross."4 Deeply suggestive words, they invite all, especially those at pivotal developmental times of "selving," to try "selving" Christ, try doing Christ, try the "cross" of sacrificial love in place of egotistical desire, try recognizing our human-divine self, try engaging in salvation – not, as Merton cautions, the "entirely legal and extrinsic" process consistent with having a "false . . . shriveled and fruitless ... inner life"; 5 but, in John Hick's words, "an actual human change, gradual transformation from natural self-centeredness . . . to a radical new orientation centered in God and manifested in the 'Fruits of the Holy Spirit.'" (In his letter to the Galatians, Paul enumerates these fruits: love, joy, peace, patience, kindness, generosity, faithful, gentleness, self-control.) In a word – a real existential grasp by the Spirit of Jesus Christ and of the Spirit of Jesus Christ, not second-hand (William

James), notional (John Henry Newman) or extrinsic (Maurice Blondel), but immanent, beginning within and ending within an actor, an agent – a kind of integrity, a kind of oneness, a oneness with the Divine, with Reality, the oneness of progressively becoming a contemplative and, therefore necessarily,



Padraic O'Hare

Padraic O'Hare is Professor of Religious and Theological Studies at Merrimack College, North Andover, MA, where he founded (1993) and directed (until 2011) its Center for the Study of Jewish-Christian -Muslim Relations. Author or editor of eight books on contemplation, interfaith relations and social justice education, he has taught about Thomas Merton for the past 15 years. He retires in June 2018.

ever more compassionate. Christ's work nurturing the undivided young adult is aided by clearing away theological language which filters and distances young adults (filters anyone) from real and vivid experience of Jesus Christ, living experience brought about by emulating, by "selving," by doing Christ. This essay clears away unhelpful theological speech. It links Christ, contemplative and compassionate, exemplar but also catalyst, to the transforming of young adults. It articulates the author's educational practice over twenty-five years with young adults; and it addresses the rich, ritual evocation of being undivided, contemplative and compassionate, the ritual called the Eucharist. It concludes by proposing the principal quality, over the course of a Christ-life, that will typify a real Christian: joy. It is infused from beginning to end with the richness of expression that marks Thomas Merton and his writing.

Helpful Theological Speech

In Faith in Exile: Seeking Hope in a Time of Doubt, Joseph Kelley writes:

There are times in the lives of all believers when one aspect of faith is more important than others. Sometimes the doctrines are of vital importance and meaning. At other times, moral precepts and the challenge they present to us become paramount. At still other times our personal encounter with God is the most keenly felt dimension of our faith.⁷

Kelley encourages plurality in theological education. Further encouragement towards plurality comes from Hinduism's vision of the differing paths to integration of self with the Self: the paths of thinkers, lovers, workers, mystics; the Jnana, Bhakti, Karma and Raja paths.8 Avery Dulles notes another pluralism: he speaks of faith as the intellectualist, fiducial and performative dimensions of mind, feeling and will, specifically the will to do justice. None of these typologies of faith should tempt us to go back to a "merely believed in" religiosity. The term is that of Johannes Metz, who linked it explicitly to Christianity's loss of young adults who search for something radical to give their lives over to, but are met with soulless legal rigor.¹⁰ It really must be insisted that practice is preeminent. "Faithfulness" rather than "faith" better captures this priority. St. Augustine urges: "Crede ut intelligas" - "Believe so that you may understand" (Tractate 27 on John). Seven centuries later, Anselm tinkers with Augustine's formula and gives Western Christianity its premier definition of theology: "Fides quaerens intellectum" - "Faith seeking understanding" (Proslogion). Practice falling in love with God and you will understand. How to practice falling in love with God? Practice being like God. The derivative and secondary nature of Metz's "merely believed in" religion (sometimes labeled "propositional faith"), comes home to us when we consider that "I believe" comes from the German lieben (to love), and that the Latin credo - "I believe" - means to give one's heart (cor + do). Be silent (contemplation) and merciful (compassion), and words (conversation) about what you are experiencing practicing will flow from the practice.

So, clearing away obscure theological speech starts by simply acknowledging the practical character of faithfulness, and by acknowledging what these practices are: contemplation and compassion, the practice of stillness and the practice of mercy. More explicitly, let us admit that theological speech which renders unity with Jesus Christ more near, less remote – theological speech *in the first instance* – is people's speech about *present experience of a relationship with God*. There are three kinds of theological speech we can name to leave us poised to peel back the edges of conflict, ideological dispute, mutual anathemas and comic pretension on the part of obscurantist

speech practitioners. Think of some of the religiously disaffected who act like a law unto themselves, ignorant of anything that has come before them and of nuance in interpreting what an inherited pattern of faithful practice (and speech about it) might mean. ("You don't have to go to Mass to be religious!") Think of officials in some Christian churches, routinely on the wrong side of history, a history suffused with the workings of the Holy Spirit. ("Being created gay is a disorder," or "Jesus only chose men to be priests.") And then there is my own tribe, the theologians, who at our most obscure recall Goethe's remark that the merely well-informed man is the most useless bore on the face of the earth.

What appears above is a legitimate burlesque. But it also implies a rich, collegial understanding of how revelation, God's self-communication, is expressed in good speech. It is a sketch of the three-fold Roman Catholic sense of *magisterium*. For Catholics, the Church's teaching emerges from the experience of the people, the bishops and the theologians, a collaboration which works when, and only when, all three experience themselves as "God's people." (And that's "teaching," not "teachings" – a verb, not a noun: a crucial distinction of my teacher, Gabriel Moran). Good theological speech emerges from these specific experiences. The words are those of Gustavo Gutierrez:

Contemplation and practice together make up the *first act*; theologizing is a *second act*. We must first establish ourselves on the terrain of spirituality and practice; only subsequently is it possible to formulate discourse on God in an authentic and respectful way. Theologizing done without the mediation of contemplation and practice does not meet the requirements of the God of the Bible. The mystery of God comes to life in contemplation and in the practice of God's plan for history; only in a second phase can this life inspire appropriate reasoning In view of this we can say that the first moment is *silence* and the second is *speech*. ¹¹

For the young adult Christian to actually experience an "intimate level of exchange" (see below) with the Spirit of Christ, dull theological speech which assumes revelation is a "thing" in a book (even a magnificent book), or worse, a dogmatic statement, must be set aside. "The image of revelation refers to what happens in intimate levels of exchange. Revelation is always present and another word for presence is revelation. The revelatory relationship requires a listener whose ear has been trained to hear all creation speak."¹² The contemplative is a listener with a trained ear – the compassionate one, hearing all creation speak. Such a listener, such a hearer of revelation, is undivided from Christ the contemplative, Christ the compassionate.

Contemplation and Compassion

The Christian contemplating (meditating) is remembering that God and the true self are one, and that life in Christ is the way. The practice is to make this remembering habitual, steadily, gently training to do away with forgetfulness. Thomas Keating writes: "God and our true selves are not separate. Though we are not God, God and our true Self are the same. Our basic core of Goodness is our true Self" (Keating 301). Merton explains the Christological character of this practice: "There is a 'movement' of meditation, expressing the basic 'paschal' rhythm of the Christian life, the passage from death to life in Christ." Christianity contains a "Cloud of Witnesses," over many centuries, attesting to being one with God. It offers consoling, empowering, metaphorical expressions, by saints gone ahead, of experiencing this oneness, and of what it is we experience when we experience it. On experiencing the oneness, a witness from the fourteenth century, the unknown author of *The*

Cloud of Unknowing, writes: "God is your being and what you are you are in God." Here is one from the twentieth, John Macquarrie: "Faith's name for Reality is God." On what it is that one experiences in being one with God, witness Augustine, Hildegard and Merton. Augustine writes in *The Confessions*:

What is it that I love when I love my God? There is a light I love, and a food, and a kind of embrace of my innerness where my soul is floodlit by light which space cannot contain, where there is sound that time cannot seize, where there is a perfume which no breeze disperses, where there is a taste for food which no amount of eating can lessen, and where there is a bond of union that no satiety can part. That is what I love when I love my God.¹⁶

Hildegard adds:

I, the fiery essence, am aflame beyond the beauty of the meadows. I gleam in the waters. I burn in the sun, moon and stars. With every breeze, as with invisible life that contains everything, I awaken everything to life. I am the Breeze that nurtures all things green. I encourage blossoms to flourish with ripening fruits. I Am the Rain from the dew that causes the grasses to laugh with the joy of life.¹⁷

Surely influenced by a great model, Hopkins ("There lives the dearest freshness deep down things" [Hopkins 27]), Merton speaks in *Hagia Sophia* of experiences of our Mother, also our sister, *Sophia*:

a dimmed light . . . a hidden wholeness mysterious Unity and Integrity an inexhaustible sweetness and purity, a silence that is a fount of action and joy. It rises up in wordless gentleness and flows out to me from the unseen roots of all created being, welcoming me tenderly.¹⁸

This practice of remembering, of not forgetting, is identical to the practice of compassion. Forgetting our identity with God and forgetting God's love, is the gateway to fear. Fear, as Merton wrote, is the beginning of war (*NSC* 112-22). The opposite of peace is not war, but fear; and the opposite of fear is freedom, freedom purchased in contemplative practice, freedom from fear and availability for compassion. Merton makes the direct link:

All men seek peace first of all with themselves. . . . We have to learn to commune with ourselves before we can communicate with other men and with God. A man who is not at peace with himself necessarily projects his interior fighting into the society of those he lives with, and spreads a contagion of conflict all around him.¹⁹

Martin Laird, OSA, in a book called *The Silent Land*, renders the link with equal eloquence:

Contemplation is the way out of the great self-centered psychodrama. When interior silence is discovered, compassion flows. If we deepen our inner silence, our compassion for others is deepened. We cannot pass through the doorways of silence without becoming part of God's embrace of all humanity in its suffering

and joy. (Laird 115)

This "first moment," as Gutierrez calls it, is this silence of contemplation, identical and synchronized to the silence of compassion. It is the meaning and purpose of contemplative practice. This is so (we know this empirically, not speculatively), because achieving silence – or stillness – is the means of remembering, of not falling into forgetfulness. At the same time, it is the cessation of chattering, a sickness of the inner ("spiritual") life which feeds fear and forgetfulness, and makes us unavailable to the other. The chattering which holds sway inside us, absent stillness and the capacity to dwell in the silent land, fixates on being

"bound and haunted by the past . . . afraid of the future," caught up in "disturbance, fear, anxiety. . . worry . . . anger, craving, and delusion" (Thich Nhat Hanh). ²⁰ It is being trapped, Merton says, in the routine, confused, chaotic and self-serving activity of the false self, obsessed with what is "exterior, transient, illusory, and trivial," feeling "helplessness, frustration, infidelity, confusion, ignorance" (*CP* 40). The opposite of "chattering" is "mindfulness," now an abused notion, but "When we are mindful, touching deeply the present moment, we can see and listen deeply, and the fruits are always understanding, acceptance, love and the desire to relieve suffering and bring joy. . . . To me mindfulness is very much like the Holy Spirit. Both are agents of healing" (Nhat Hanh 14). All this points to existential encounter, in contemplative practice, with the Spirit of Jesus Christ: nothing paranormal, something, in fact, commonplace though profound – experiencing someone, here Jesus Christ, as real and vivid because we try, because we engage. As John Macquarrie, the great existentialist theologian, wrote "it happens . . . truly over and over again in the experience of those who have made it [or, in this instance, "him"] part of their history." part of their history."

It is not only the encounter with Jesus, but the teachings of Jesus, too, that speak to the undivided, contemplative, compassionate self. Consider five teachings of Jesus among others: repent (Mk 1:14); the Reign of God has come near (Mk 1:14); cultivate simplicity, like children (Mk. 10:13-16); do not cling, cravingly, to anything (Mt 10:39); and above all, do not be afraid (Lk 12:4-7 – including the wonderful: "Are not five sparrows sold for two pennies? Yet not one of them is forgotten in God's sight. But even the hairs of your head are counted. Do not be afraid; you are of more value than many sparrows"). Each of the values conveyed in this teaching can be associated with fruits of contemplative practice. Simplicity, detachment and peace are straightforward enough. Thomas Keating provides a rich psychological interpretation of repentance and of the nearness of the Reign of God, useful alongside necessary theological and ethical meanings and challenges. He notes that "repent" translates the Hebrew *teshuva*, turning around, and provides a psychological reading: perhaps the chattering person, the non-contemplative, is searching for happiness in the wrong direction, in unhealthy "programs of safety and security, affection and esteem, power and control"; and then: "The reign of God is what happens. It is not any one thing that happens. It is the fact of God entering our lives at any moment and shifting things around and our consenting to the break in" (Keating 301).

And Eucharist

Jesus Christ is encountered in contemplative practice, in the works of mercy and in his teachings; and, impossible to place too much importance on, Jesus Christ is encountered in the richest possible Eucharistic celebration, a celebration which is nothing less than catalyst and confirmation for the way of being called *kata holos* ("catholic"), affirming and therefore embracing everything and everyone as "charged with the grandeur of God" (Hopkins 27). This is a way of being, a worldview, founded on this sequence of experiences: I see beauty all around; I experience this beauty as gift; I am grateful; I am moved to share these gifts of beauty.²³ Pedagogically, the Eucharist is a ritual event to align us in gratefulness with Jesus Christ, to heighten presence and to expand mercy so that we depart every Eucharist rededicated to be *compañero*, one who shares bread with others. It is for this reason that Gutierrez says, "We do not have the full Eucharist if we only have the 'memory of me' in Luke, the 'words of institution.' We need the dual 'memory of me,' John where Jesus tells his follower at the end of the supper to do what he does, serve" (Lk 22:7-20; Jn. 13:3-15).²⁴

I have been working with young adults in a collegiate setting for thirty years. The last twenty of those years I have been honing a three-fold practice: coaching young adults in contemplation, immersing

young adults in monastic retreat, and engaging young adults in study about two people who grew better and better, over the course of their lives, at being human: Dorothy Day and Thomas Merton. Coaching young adults in contemplative or meditative practice entails motivating them to engage in the skill set of growing more and more adept at accessing their inner lives, the vast landscape of stillness where our true or real selves dwell. My motivational speech, or rhetoric, includes pointing to the prevalence of contemplative practice at places like Google, Apple and the Pentagon, which use contemplation to promote efficiency in exercising expertise; it also includes pointing to the neuroscience that attests to the benefits of contemplative practice.²⁵ However, most of my motivational speech focuses on the spiritual. That is, it centers on cultivating the habit of living a free life, a life lived from within, which is identical to the skill set of contemplation, or meditation. More specifically, most of this speech introduces young adults to a *religious* spirituality; it invites them into substantial dialogue and intimate wrestling with a great cloud of witnesses, into an encounter with the Holy, the Divine, the Source, God; a discovery (in the words of Catherine of Genoa, d. 1510), that "My being is God, not by simple participation but by a true transformation of my being" (King 87).

And so I teach young adults to engage in contemplative practice. The coaching is flexible and invites experimentation, but it proposes techniques of Japanese Zen (*zazen*) as a best practice. I try to be ideologically flexible, to provide (I've been assured many times over these years) safe space for humanist as well as religious practitioners. For example, I invoke the rich "religious" but humanist spirit of Ronald Dworkin, whose last book before he died in 2013 sought to articulate a notion of secular sacredness. his emphasis coexists with a religious motive for practice, and guided meditations which evoke and accommodate it. That is, in classes I conduct, some *pray* alongside humanist sisters and brothers. The praying is cultivating silence, inspired by Evagrius' dictum that all prayer begins with the "setting aside of thoughts." Over many years this practice has been nurturing young adults who continue in religious affiliation as well as two kinds of "nones": young adults who are no longer religiously affiliated even if they continue believing in God, and young adults who no longer believe in God. All are attending, as Merton says, to a "reality that is present to us and in us: call it Being, call it Atman, call it Pneuma . . . or Silence." Over many years this practice has been nurturing young adults attending, as the continue believing in God, and young adults who no longer believe in God. All are attending, as Merton says, to a "reality that is present to us and in us: call it Being, call it Atman, call it Pneuma . . .

Over almost twenty of these years that I have honed this practice, I have accompanied young adults, mostly students at the college at which I serve, spending several days on retreat with healthy monastics. These are Benedictine monks of remarkable gifts, their lives instruction in universal values for those who aspire, in the words of the Benedictine Joan Chittister, to "living the ordinary life extraordinary well . . . to live life beyond the superficial and uncaring, to live calmly in the midst of chaos, productively in an arena of waste, lovingly in a maelstrom of individualism, gently in a world full of violence." Every feature of the brothers' common life promotes these values, so say the young adults with whom I have journeyed to the monastery. Among these inspirations, the brothers' practice of the *opus Dei* (the "work of God" – their adoration and praise), especially the Eucharist, has moved hearts.

Finally, for the last twelve of these years, I have conducted a course, now called "Having Heroes: Their Lives and Yours." The course invites attention to two lives, those of Thomas Merton and Dorothy Day, including young-adult Merton's and Day's bumpy "selving" to live meaningful lives beyond self-absorption and the trivial, their overcoming self-loathing and marking their times and ours. I present Merton and Day as icons of contemplation and compassion, of whom Pope Francis said: "Merton was above all a man of prayer, a thinker who challenged the certitudes of his time

and opened new horizons for souls and for the Church. . . . a man of dialogue, a promoter of peace between peoples and religions"; and of Day: "Her social activism, her passion for justice and for the cause of the oppressed, were inspired by the Gospel, her faith, and the example of the saints." 29

Contemplative practice has inspired and been nurtured by two books I have authored over these years,³⁰ and the three-fold practice sketched here is detailed in essays I have published in outlets for Merton scholarship in 2002, 2015 and 2017.³¹ The last contains testimony from young adults about elements of this practice as it has affected them.

Over the years, none of this regime has resulted in vast numbers evincing intense devotion to Jesus Christ as their principal analogue and great companion in "selving." But I have seen some quiet discovery or further strengthening of Christ-life in some of my students. Bringing Humanist and Christian practitioners together in contemplation, at the monastery and in class, creating a safe space for spiritual plurality where we can address both experiences of faithfulness, requires gentle and modest ways. There is consolation here in Thomas Merton's last known words. Having concluded his presentation at the Red Cross Center outside Bangkok on December 10, 1968, just before heading back to his bungalow for a nap and a shower (and accidental death), Merton was told someone in the audience was disappointed that he had said nothing about converting people. Merton's response was, "What we are asked to do at present is not so much to speak of Christ as to let Him live in us so that people may find Him by feeling how He lives is us." 32

Conclusion: Joy

In concluding, I return to "selving" and to Hopkins' poem. Everyone selves, and everyone cries out, "What I do is me; for that I came." We already have that great cloud of witnesses to "selving," so that one is able to "do" Christ over the course of one's life. First there is Jesus himself: "I am in the Father and the Father is in me" (Jn. 14:10): that is, first Jesus Christ "selving" God. Then there is Saint Paul: "For me, to live is Christ" (Phil. 1:21), and "It is no longer I who live, but it is Christ who lives in me" (Gal. 2:20) – and so on through the ages of Christianity. Notably, there is Francis De Sales' "Live Christ," in his Introduction to the Devout Life. To our own time, generations of "brothers' boys" (now boys and girls, young women and men) are taught by the sons of John Baptist de La Salle to pray every morning thusly: brother – "Live Jesus in our hearts"; students – "Forever."

Of all the strengths, all the grace that the Holy One makes available to us and that we strive to receive, the greatest is joy, the joy of being undivided (contemplative) and therefore available, without fear or insecurity, for others (compassionate). Laurence Freeman, OSB provides a rich affirmation of the centrality of joy: "As Jesus looked deeply into his own emptiness on the eve of his death and communicated what he felt to his disciples it was joy." Freeman is reflecting here on the text, "As the Father has loved me, so I love you. I have said these things to you so that my joy may be in you and your joy may be complete" (Jn. 15:11). It is also the essential point of Gutierrez's masterpiece *On Job: God Talk and the Suffering of the Innocent* (see especially chapter 10 [82-92]), that it is possible to suffer without being sorrowful, an insight he ascribes to an old Indian woman. Gutierrez notes the mistranslation in verse 6 of chapter 42, Job being made to say, "I repent in dust and dashes," when the preposition could be translated "of" dust and ashes. That is, I am still suffering, but I am no longer sorrowful ("dust and ashes"). I was suffering *and* sorrowful when I only heard of you "by the hearing of the ear, but now my eye sees you" (42:5). That is, I have had a contemplative breakthrough, and while I am still suffering, I am no longer sorrowful. Exegetes agree that verses 7 through 17, the "happy

ending" and restoration that we have inherited as the end of the Book of Job, are an add-on; at the end of verse 6, Job is still suffering but already joyous in seeing God! (Those of us who have studied with Gutierrez and have the joy of knowing him, hear always his words: that the question of the Book of Job is: "Is possible to love God for nothing?")

The unfathomable depth, range and duration of human suffering, the "pain that cannot forget" (Aeschylus), "the tears at the heart of things" (Virgil), may give us pause to designate joy as the final fruit of undivided life in Christ. But it must be so. This joy is a light in our lives, a fire in our hearts. What can Augustine be speaking of but a joyous heart: "Let peace glow in your heart, so as to kindle others" (Sermon 353.7); and Hopkins again (in The Wreck of the Deutschland): "Let him easter in us, be a dayspring to the dimness of us, be a crimson-cresseted east" (Hopkins 24). Christ is the light, the fire, in Teilhard de Chardin, the "Divine diaphany" (transparency): "Throughout my life, by means of my life, the world has little by little caught fire in my sight until aflame all around me, it has become almost luminous from within. . . . Such has been my experience in contact with the earth – the diaphany of the Divine at the heart of a universe on fire" (see King 237). Merton brings things around to this conclusion: "The only true joy on earth is to escape from the prison of our own false self, and enter by love into union with the Life Who dwells and sings within the essence of every creature and in the core of our own souls" (NSC 25). Christian joy and undivided being are activated because one is increasingly contemplative (and therefore necessarily compassionate). As Merton wrote: "Christ . . . came on earth to form contemplatives" (NSC 250).

- Gerard Manley Hopkins, Poems and Prose, ed. W. H. Gardner (Baltimore: Penguin, 1963) 51; subsequent references will be cited as "Hopkins" parenthetically in the text.
- 2. David Steindl-Rast, Deeper than Words: Living the Apostles' Creed (New York: Image Books, 2010) 49.
- Thomas Keating, Foundations for the Christian Life & Contemplative Prayer (New York: Continuum, 2002) 301; subsequent references will be cited as "Keating" parenthetically in the text.
- 4. Thomas Merton, *New Seeds of Contemplation* (New York: New Directions, 1961) 157; subsequent references will be cited as "*NSC*" parenthetically in the text.
- Thomas Merton, Learning to Love: Exploring Solitude and Freedom. Journals, vol. 6: 1966-1967, ed. Christine M. Bochen (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1997) 345.
- 6. Denis Iokhalm & Timothy R. Philips, eds., *More Than One Way? Four Views of Salvation in a Pluralist World* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1996) 39.
- 7. Joseph T. Kelley, Faith in Exile: Seeking Hope in a Time of Doubt (New York: Paulist Press, 2003) 39.
- 8. See Huston Smith, *The World's Religions* (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 1991) 26-50.
- 9. See Avery Dulles, "The Meaning of Faith Considered in Relationship to Justice," in John Haughey, ed., *The Faith That Does Justice: Examining the Christian Sources for Social Change* (New York: Paulist Press, 1977) 10-46.
- 10. Johannes B. Metz, *The Emergent Church: The Future of Christianity in a Post-Bourgeois World* (New York: Crossroad, 1986) 7.
- 11. Gustavo Gutierrez, On Job: God-Talk and the Suffering of the Innocent (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1987) xiii; subsequent references will be cited as "Gutierrez, Job" parenthetically in the text.
- 12. Gabriel Moran, The Present Revelation (New York: Herder and Herder, 1972) 142.
- 13. Thomas Merton, *Contemplative Prayer* (New York: Herder & Herder, 1969) 40; subsequent references will be cited as "*CP*" parenthetically in the text.
- 14. See Martin Laird, OSA, *Into the Silent Land: A Guide to Christian Practice of Contemplation* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006) 9; subsequent references will be cited as "Laird" parenthetically in the text.
- 15. Douglas Martin, "Rev. John Macquarrie, 87, Scottish Theologian, Dies," The New York Times (June 3, 2007).
- Joseph. T. Kelley, ed., Saint Augustine of Hippo: Selections from Confessions and Other Essential Writings (Woodstock, VT: Skylight Paths, 2010) 77.

- 17. Hildegard, *Book of Divine Works*, Vision 1, in Ursula King, *Christian Mystics: Their Lives and Legacies throughout the Ages* (Mahwah, NJ: Hidden Spring, 2001) 81-82; subsequent references will be cited as "King" parenthetically in the text.
- 18. Thomas Merton, The Collected Poems of Thomas Merton (New York: New Directions, 1977) 363.
- 19. Thomas Merton, No Man Is an Island (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1955) 120-21.
- 20. Thich Nhat Hanh, *Living Buddha*, *Living Christ* (New York: Riverhead Books, 1996) 14; subsequent references will be cited as "Nhat Hanh" parenthetically in the text.
- Thomas Merton, The Inner Experience: Notes on Contemplation, ed. William H. Shannon (San Francisco: HarperCollins, 2003) 35.
- 22. John Macquarrie, Principles of Christian Theology (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1966) 290.
- 23. Brother Elias, OSB, *With One Heart* (Weston, VT: Benedictine Foundation of Vermont, 2004 [DVD of the Priory's fiftieth anniversary]).
- 24. Padraic O'Hare, "The Church of the Poor" (notes from a graduate course at Boston College on Liberation Theology conducted by Gustavo Gutierrez, August 8, 2008) 5.
- Matthew Richard, Antoine Lutz, Richard J. Davidson, "Mind of the Meditator," Scientific American 311.5 (November 2014) 38 ff.
- 26. Ronald Dworkin, Religion without God (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2013).
- 27. Thomas Merton, *The Hidden Ground of Love: Letters on Religious Experience and Social Concerns*, ed. William H. Shannon (New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 1985) 115 [April 13, 1967 letter to Amiya Chakravarty].
- Joan Chittister, OSB, Wisdom Distilled from the Daily: Living the Rule of Saint Benedict Today (New York: HarperOne, 1991) 4.
- Pope Francis, "Address of the Holy Father to a Joint Session of the United States Congress September 24, 2015," The Merton Annual 28 (2015) 21, 20.
- See Padraic O'Hare, The Way of Faithfulness: Contemplation and Formation in the Church (Valley Forge, PA: Trinity International, 1993); and Padraic O'Hare, Busy Life, Peaceful Center: A Book of Meditating (Allen, TX: Thomas More, 1995).
- 31. See Padraic O'Hare, "Merton and Masterpiece Making," *The Merton Seasonal* 26.3 (Fall 2001) 10-17; Padraic O'Hare, "Merton and Young Adults in the Wilderness," *The Merton Seasonal* 40.1 (Spring, 2015) 42-44; Padraic O'Hare, "Young Adult Spiritual Lives: Merton, Moran and Monastic Resources," *The Merton Annual* 29 (2016) 203-20.
- 32. John Howard Griffin, "In Search of Thomas Merton," in *The Thomas Merton Studies Center* (Santa Barbara, CA: Unicorn Press, 1971) 22.
- 33. Bruno Barnhardt & Joseph Wong, eds., *Purity of Heart and Contemplation: A Monastic Dialogue between Christian and Asian Traditions* (New York: Continuum, 2001) 256.